Between the hardships of moving to a new city, a dying grandmother, and secretly converting to Catholicism and practicing Mass in her bedroom closet using matzo and grape juice for the Eucharist, Justine Silver, the protagonist of Sarah Darer Littman's *Confessions of a Closet Catholic* (2005), has a lot on her plate. So much so that positions herself as a martyr of legend within her own cosmology, patterned after Edith Stein, a Jewish convert to Catholicism who was murdered during the Holocaust. Justine has another saint in her life, though, namely her older sister, whom she refers to as *Saint* Helena, that she competes with for her mother's attention. Through a generic analysis of the text, we can reveal the ways that *Confessions* fits into diverse paradigms of hagiography, young adult fiction, and bildungsroman. What's more, through Justine's evolving ideas of martyrdom and sainthood and how they relate with her Jewish upbringing, we can see the various ways that Littman conceptualizes faith: faith-as-practice, faith-as-belief, faith-as-identity, distinctions that ultimately break down towards the book's end, revealing how these concepts intersect with notions of self-love and social justice in the 21th century; even chocolate can be an act of faith and an act of care.